

Discussion on Roman Missals

www.liturgyinstitute.org

In honour of the 450th anniversary of the *Missale Romanum* of 1570 and the 50th anniversary of the *Missale Romanum* of 1970, an international, ecumenical discussion was hosted by the Pontifical Institute of Liturgy at Sant'Anselmo, Rome, 17-18 November 2020 as part of the project *Liturgiam aestimare : Appreciating Liturgy* ([link](#)).

Hosts:

RR. **Gregory Polan** OSB, from Conception Abbey, Missouri; Abbot Primate of the Benedictine Confederation, Chancellor of the Ateneo Sant'Anselmo.

R.P. **Bernhard Eckerstorfer** OSB, monk of Kremsmünster Abbey, Austria; Rector, Pontificium Athenaeum Sancti Anselmi de Urbe.

R.P. **Jordi-Agustí Piqué i Collado** OSB, monk of Montserrat Abbey, Spain; President, Pontificium Institutum Liturgicum (PIL), Sant'Anselmo, Rome.

Four papers were submitted and read by the participants in preparation for discussion at the colloquium. Participants either gave a paper or a prepared response to a paper; they included a religious superior and scholars with terminal degrees in their field.

Participants:

RR. **Ian Ernest**, Anglican Archbishop; Director, Anglican Centre, and The Personal Representative of the Archbishop of Canterbury to the Holy See.

R.P. **Stefan Geiger** OSB, monk of Schäftlarn Abbey, Germany; Lect.: Faculty of Theology and PIL, Sant'Anselmo, Rome; Liturgy Institute London.

Prof. **Basilius "Bert" Groen**, Prof. em., University of Graz; Prof. inv.: KU Leuven; Pontifical Oriental Institute, Rome; Liturgy Institute London.

R.P. **James Leachman** OSB, monk of Ealing Abbey, London; Prof. em. PIL; Prof. inv. KU Leuven; participant, Process Work Psychology.

R.P. **Daniel McCarthy** OSB, monk of St. Benedict's Abbey, Atchison, Kansas; Lect., PIL; Liturgy Institute London; Prof. inv. KU Leuven.

Prof. **Gerard Moore**, President, The Australian Institute of Theological Education, Pennant Hills, New South Wales.

R.P. **Pachomius Okogie** OSB, monk of Ewu Priory, Edo, Nigeria; member, Perspective Science, Austin, Texas; ex-secretary general, teacher, Sant'Anselmo, Rome.

The Abbot Primate Gregory Polan opened the colloquium with prayer and welcome. The Rector of the Athenaeum, Dom Bernhard Eckerstorfer, next welcomed participants from other institutions.

The first paper discussed was prepared by Prof. Stefan Geiger and titled “The amendment of Good Friday prayer for the Jews in 2008: Liturgical-theological reflections on the *lex orandi/credendi*”. Rather than reopen the discussion on the Good Friday prayer for the Jews penned by Pope Benedict XVI for use in the extraordinary form of the Roman rite, Prof. Geiger turns to the *New Perspective on Paul*, introduced by E.P. Sanders and developed by D.G. Dunn, to discern how the apostle transcended the personal conflict between his Jewish origins and mission to the Gentiles through his understanding of covenant. Prof. Geiger discerns this Pauline influence upon the Holy Father as he composed this new prayer for the traditional form. From this Prof. Geiger proposes “a hermeneutical norm for liturgical theology” in “covenantal liturgy” understood as enacted relationship, which is “the unifying *lex* of faith and prayer (*credendi/orandi*)”. Of particular interest was the passing reference by Prof. Geiger that the emotional response to the prayer for the Jews has to be considered as part of the context shaping the text of the prayer, because attending to the emotions helps to balance the call for a solely rational approach. Prepared responses were given by Prof. Basilius “Bert” Groen and then by Prof. Gerard Moore, which was followed by discussion.

The second paper discussed was prepared by Dom. Pachomius Okogie and entitled “The sacramental and real presence of Christ in the Eucharist: then and now”. The historical account begins with a diminished understanding of the unity between symbol and reality in the fourth century, which might have contributed to the apparent conflict between Paschasius and Ratramnus, brother monks of the abbey of Corbie, in the early to mid-ninth century. Transubstantiation was philosophically explained by Thomas Aquinas, but it has remained a subject of disagreement in the Catholic and various Protestant articulations of Christ’s eucharistic presence, as carefully detailed in the paper. One ever quizzical note is the practice of the presider standing at the North *end* of the eucharistic table, not on the typically near or far *side* of the table, beginning with the *Book of Common Prayer* of 1552. Dom Pachomius points first to a symbolic way forward based on the work of Louis Marie Chauvet, *Symbole et Sacrament* published in 1987. He proposes a symbolic exchange, whereby God lavishes gifts upon us by which we are made gracious and in return give ourselves to others as gratuitous gift. The initial divine gift corresponds to anamnesis; its reception, to epiclesis; and the return gift, to a moral way of life lived in service to others. The second way forward is a return to the original meaning of ‘sacrament’ (from *sacramentum, mysterion*: the saving action of God) based on L.M Chauvet and Adolf Adam, whereby Christ himself is the primordial sacrament, and “the Church, being the body of Christ, is the universal sacrament of salvation” (cf. *Lumen gentium* 48). In this case anamnesis is the experience of the Church “being itself taken in the present into what it narrates in the past”. The third way forward is to recall the understanding of sacrifice mentioned in Hebrews 13.15-16 (i.e., as a sacrifice of praise, doing good works and sharing one’s resources), and in the writings of Tertullian, Clement and Origen (i.e., sacrifice as unceasing prayer): “it is therefore a festival of the Lord if we offer perpetually the sacrifice, if we pray without ceasing, if our prayer rises like incense before him in the morning and the lifting up of our hands is for him the evening sacrifice” (in BRADSHAW *Daily Prayer in the Early Church*, 2008: 64). Prepared responses were given both by Prof. Daniel McCarthy and by Prof. Stefan Geiger, followed by general discussion.

Archbishop Ian Ernest opened the second day of the colloquium with prayer and an address. His was followed by the greeting of Dom Jordi-Augustí Piqué i Collado who hosted the event. During our proceedings that morning it was announced that Dom Jordi was appointed by the Congregation of Education to a third term as President of the PIL.

The third paper discussed was prepared by Dom James Leachman and titled "The Roman Missal in Context: Intercultural encounters; trauma and adaptation," 17 November 2020 at Generative Communities Colloquium tredecimum (Rome Conversation 3), In honour of the 450th anniversary of the *Missale Romanum* of 1570 and the 50th anniversary of that of 1970, Pontifical Institute of Liturgy, Rome, unpublished". Since retiring from teaching Liturgy at the PIL in 2015, Dom James has dedicated himself to work on historical and present trauma, discrimination and abuse with the aim of transforming community living. His paper considered how the *Missale Romanum* has been instrumentalised as an evangelising and disciplinary tool. The paper addressed the research question: "How can the history of the Roman Mass and the communities it supports be read as a story of intercultural encounter, trauma and adaptation and as the continual beginning and repetition of healing and recovery in the Catholic Church?" The paper is based on the believer's perspective that sharing in Jesus' claim to equality with God enables her or him to confront, transcend and integrate life's traumas and changes; and to allow such a 'believer in community' to grow in self-awareness and to discover access to the Transcendent. The paper integrates the history of evangelisation in various cultures to the *Missale Romanum* of 1570 and again to that of 1970, considering as a process of Inculturation - Adaptation - Acculturation, most recently seen in the Amazon Synod of 2020. The paper also draws upon Dom James' study of Process Oriented Psychology and thus: personal reflections on his own thoughts, feelings and responses; reflection upon his life in his monastic community; and his relationship with all those whom he has taught and with whom he has learned and now studies. Five poems were integrated into the work. Prepared responses were given both by Prof. Gerard Moore and by Prof. Daniel McCarthy, followed by general discussion.

The fourth paper discussed was prepared by Dr. Gerard Moore and titled, "Origins of the interrelated concepts of organic development and noble simplicity". Prof. Moore, according to the abstract of his paper, notes that: "There is a continuing debate around the implementation of the liturgical reforms instigated by the Bishops at the Second Vatican Council and established in the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy (4 December 1963). Recently Clare Johnson reviewed the discussions around the concept of 'organic development', a construct that has been pushed to the fore as a norm for grounding authentic change to the liturgy as opposed to inappropriate or precipitous developments ("From Organic Growth to Liturgico-Plasticity", *Theological Studies* 76: 1 [2015] 87-111). Johnson's invitation to view organic development in terms of neuroplasticity opened new horizons for implementing change in line with an organic metaphor. Mindful of Johnson's research, this series of two articles seeks to look into the past rather than toward the future. Through the seminal writings of Joachim Winckelmann (1717-1768), the construct of 'organic development', particularly in relationship to the aesthetic principle of 'noble simplicity', was established as a cornerstone of the late 18th century movement of German Neo-classicism. There are lines of influence from Winckelmann

through to both the German liturgical scholar Anton Baumstark (1872-1948), who championed the dynamic of ‘organic development’ in the study of liturgy, and the English expert on liturgical texts, Edmund Bishop (1846-1917), who proposed that the genius of the Roman Rite lay in the Roman virtues of ‘noble simplicity’. A close examination of the classicist roots of organic development and noble simplicity provides a range of insights into the contours, presuppositions and limitations of current liturgical disputes”. Prepared responses to his paper were given both by Prof. James Leachman and by Prof. Stefan Geiger, followed by general discussion.

Origins of the colloquium:

Over a prolonged Italian dinner, held in Palermo during the conference of *Societas Liturgica* in August 2007, discussion turned to the felt need for a more comprehensive examination of the post-Vatican II liturgical rites in various churches. In response we developed the project *Liturgiam aestimare : Appreciating Liturgy* ([link](#)) to be both ecumenical, international and interdisciplinary. We hope that our promoting shared study and reflection may assist Christians in their desire for a deeper unity. The project consists of three tasks: 1) research and publishing ([link](#)), 2) teaching Liturgy ([link](#)) and 3) an ongoing conversation held in a series of colloquia ([link](#)).

The first colloquium was held on 31 May 2008 at Sant’Anselmo, Rome. From our discussion, we published the book *Appreciating the Collect: An Irenic Methodology* ([link](#); St Michael’s Abbey Press, Farnborough Hampshire 2008) in which we present a method for interpreting liturgical texts that combines the clear and detailed understanding of the Latin language, as taught by Reginald Foster OCD, and the historical-critical, textual hermeneutic of Renato De Zan, a professor at the PIL. A similar volume is *The Collect in the Churches of the Reformation* edited by Bridget Nichols ([link](#); SCM 2012) of the Church of Ireland Theological Institute.

The second colloquium was held on 11 September 2009 at St Michael’s Abbey, Farnborough, England, and a study day followed. The papers and discussion addressed the theme “Human Maturation in the Liturgy”. This colloquium sought to discern and describe the process of human maturation as it appears in the prayers and rites of the liturgy. How to foster human maturation through good celebration of the liturgy was the topic at the third colloquium held on 6 January 2010 at Clement Manor, Greenfield, Wisconsin. This consideration of human maturation has helped us to clarify our proper contribution to the interpretation of the liturgical celebration.

Concurrent with these two colloquia on human maturation we published a second book, *Transition in the Easter Vigil: Becoming Christians. Paschali in vigilia Christiani nominis fieri* ([link](#); Farnborough 2011) in which we seek to trace the process of human maturation in the sacraments of Christian initiation celebrated in the context of the Easter vigil, and from this to answer the question what difference the Easter vigil makes in the life of one celebrating its rites.

During the second colloquium, the one held at St Michael's Abbey, Farnborough, Fr Ephrem Carr, OSB, encouraged the development of a teaching institution in England. That weekend Abbot Martin Shipperlee of Ealing and Abbot Cuthbert Brogan of Farnborough together with Frs James Leachman, OSB, and Daniel McCarthy, OSB, agreed to serve on a board to promote the establishment of a research and teaching *Institutum Liturgicum* in England and Wales with a faculty of liturgy which would offer courses in liturgical studies and undertake research and publishing. The curriculum is intended to offer in English a core group of the courses offered in Italian at the PIL. The President's Council of the PIL has constantly endorsed our project; its sometime Dean, Ephrem Carr, serves as moderator. Our courses are accredited by KU Leuven.

In preparation for the 2011 inauguration of the *Institutum Liturgicum* London, for our fourth colloquium we returned to Sant'Anselmo on 29 May 2010. We sought to classify the different rationales for liturgy curricula currently employed at selected institutions. We considered the teaching and study of liturgy from an ecumenical perspective on the previous day during our first Anglican – Roman Catholic Symposium dedicated to the "Consensus in Liturgical Research, Differentiation in Liturgical Renewal". The teaching and study of liturgy specifically in England and Wales was the topic of a study day hosted by the Lincoln School of Theology and jointly sponsored with the project Appreciating the Liturgy, on 24 September 2010 at the Cathedral Centre, Lincoln. A summary of selected presentations from all three of these days is provided in *Liturgy Studies and Teaching*, a dedicated number of *Benedictine Culture* published in 2010.

Inspired by the insights on how human maturation is reflected in the liturgy and how the good celebration of liturgy promotes human maturation at all stages of life, we turned our attention from personal maturation to communal maturation and developed the *Generative Communities* series of *Atchison Conversations* ([link](#)). The list of their titles follows:

Born of the Spirit, 7-8 January 2014

Communities generating a vocational way of life in members, 6-7 January 2015

Relinquishing - living - hoping, 6-7 January 2015

Roadmaps for critical junctures, 5-6 January 2016

Framing a monastery's identity, 10-11 January 2017

Nurturing leadership, 9-10 January 2018

Engendering conversation, 9-10 January 2019

Freeing Memories, 9-10 January 2020

Invoking our Becoming: Maturing into a Vision, 7-8 January 2021

While the series of conversations continues in Atchison, we are grateful to have returned to Rome for the above described Colloquium XIII and we hope to be able to hold another in November 2021 on the same topic in the hope of publishing the collected papers. At that time we have scheduled a book presentations for Gerard Moore's volume *The Collects for Ordinary Time: A Study in the Roman Missal* ([link](#)) and Daniel McCarthy's volume *Word and Spirit: On*

the double role of presiding in the assembly and directing the prayer ([link](#)), both of which are currently at the printer, thanks to St. Michael's Abbey Press, Farnborough, Hampshire.

You may also be interested in attending a book presentation on the letters of Cicero to family and close associates titled *Ossium Carnes Multae: The Bones' Meats Abundant from the epistles of Marcus Tullius Cicero* ([link](#)) scheduled for 20 April 2021 at 11:45-12:30 to be held both online by live video streaming and in person at Sant'Anselmo.